MINUTES OF THE BORNO FOOD SECURITY SECTOR MEETING

Location: Borno State Ministry of Agriculture and Natural Resources (MoANR), Conference Room
Date: 16 June 2019
Time: 10:13 am – 12:05 pm

AGENDA

1. Welcome, Opening Remarks and Round of introductions (5 min)
2. Review of action points and approval of minutes of the previous meeting (5 min)
3. Presentation on the upcoming cash and market research for cash & voucher programming, by IRC (15 min)
4. Experience sharing by partners on per capita or per household approach in FSL programming - Save the Children, Catholic Relief Service and ZOA (40 min)
5. Sector updates (20 min)
6. Partner updates (15 min)
   a. Government stakeholders (MoA, PCNI, NEMA, SEMA, MRRR, NCFRMI, etc.)
   b. Others
7. AOB (5 min)

SUMMARY OF ACTION POINTS

1. Sector to invite partners using per HH approach to share experience following the presentation by partners using per capita approach.
2. Sector to share SCI, CRS and ZOA presentation on their per capita approach.
3. Sector to invite the National Social Safety Nets Coordinating Office (NASSCO) to the sector meeting – Pending
4. Sector with support from partners to revise the harmonization and targeting guidance notes – Pending
5. Sector to follow up with WFP on FSL-related CFM and invite WFP to present and lead a discussion – Next meeting
6. Sector to reach out to the government and partners regarding providing support to the IDPs in the 5 informal settlements in MMC where rapid assessments were done recently and indicating critical need for food assistance – Pending

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>PROCEEDING</th>
<th>ACTION POINTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Welcome, Opening Remarks and Round of introductions</td>
<td>Meeting was opened by the Chair and followed by self-introduction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Review of action points and approval of previous minutes</td>
<td>Pending items from the meeting will be part of the action points for next meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Sector to invite the National Social Safety Nets Coordinating Office (NASSCO) to the sector meeting – Pending</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Sector with support from partners to revise the harmonization and targeting guidance notes – Pending</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Sector through its SAFE WG to follow up with CCCM/S-NFI Sector on fire incident analysis and possible joint actions on fire prevention and awareness raising – Ongoing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Sector to follow up with WFP on FSL-related CFM and invite WFP to present and lead a discussion – Next meeting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Sector to reach out to the government and partners regarding providing support to the IDPs in the 5 informal settlements in MMC where rapid assessments were done recently and indicating critical need for food assistance – Pending</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. FSS to facilitate the discussion between AAH and WFP on coordinating and capitalizing on AAH new grant which gives flexibility of taking into new arrival caseloads to cover gaps where needed.
   - Ongoing

After the review, the minutes of the meeting held on 21 May was adopted.

3 Presentation on the upcoming cash and market research for cash & voucher programming, by IRC
The full presentation is available at:

Please also find a 4-pager document detailing the research objectives and questions. For partners who are interested in taking part in this research, please fill in the attached form and send it to Dauda Koroma (Dauda.Koroma@rescue.org) by 21 June.

Key feedback from partners is related to the research design focusing on projects that have started in May 2019 or after. Majority of FSL CVA projects have already started their cash and vouchers distribution and will go on till next year. Interested partners asked if there is any way IRC can tweak their research design to fit into this context.

4 Experience sharing by partners on per capita or per household approach in FSL programming - Save the Children, Catholic Relief Service and ZOA

CRS Food Assistance E-voucher Programming
• Borno (8,586 HHs / 49,301 Individuals)
  - Gubio, Kaga, and Magumeri LGAs
  - Average HH size 5.7 Individuals
• Yobe (5,422 HHs / 37,154 Individuals)
  - Gujba and Gulani LGAs
  - Average HH size 6.8 Individuals
  - Total Caseload 14,008 HHs / 86,455 Individuals
  - 3,464.45 NGN per Individual
  - 70% Food 30% Nutrient Rich Food
• Positives
  - Addressing the needs of individual families (greater average HH size)
  - Greater acceptance/understanding by the communities
  - The challenges impact the organization greater than those benefiting from the program
  - Aligns with CRS global programming
• Challenges
  - Greater administrative burden
    • RedRose: Group vs. Individual Distributions
    • Caseload List Maintenance (high levels of monitoring/dynamic caseload)
  - MEAL/Data Implications
    • Self reported HH size and disaggregation (limited biometrics)
  - Historic caseload - Not harmonized
    • Impact on caseload/targets (and budget) when updating records
    • Sensitization for updating records
• Relevant Experiences:
• Retargeting for 2019 (reduced by ~35%)

ZOA Food Assistance E-voucher Programming

- Why per capita approach
  o Supports ZOA’s mission: every individual counts
  o ‘Most fair’ approach: it supports gender sensitivity
  o Fixed costs (firewood, water) are very limited % of MEB. Variable costs are main share of the MEB.
  o To overcome main issue of ‘ghost’ households

- Advantages
  o Tailor-made approach
  o Fairest approach
  o Reduced risk of ghost households
  o Improves psychological valuation of the household

- Disadvantages
  o Tendency to unnaturally increase household size
  o Risk of increased population growth
  o Not recommended if MEB <100%
  o More costly in terms of time and money

- Mitigations
  o Plan pre-registration exercise
  o Physically verify all household members on-site
  o Ask who is their mother/father, give 10 naira to child and ask to bring it to his/her mother
  o Consider household member threshold
  o Consider member minimum
  o Check relationship of household members with surrounding households
  o Collection GPS information
  o Inform beneficiaries from the start that they can expect random checks
  o Random spot checks
  o (Digital) verification with other humanitarian partners
  o Use community (both beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries, local leaders) to verify correctness of information

SC Food Assistance E-voucher Programming

Strategic Objective- Household access to and availability of diversified and nutritious food, especially during lean season, increased

Programs Geographic Coverage:
- State: Borno
- Local Government Areas: Maiduguri, Jere, Konduga, & Mafa

Food Security Total Beneficiary Reach:
- Total Households- 55,908
- Total Individuals- 305,968

SC reach each of these HHs through e-vouchers which can be cashed out a designated pre-selected vendors. The cashless system allows vendors access cash through banks, restocking shops, linking markets and encouraging economic activities.
Transfer Approach

- 17,000 per HHs was SC initial transfer value
- 3,532 per capita for all registered HHs
- 2,522 per capita for all HHs in IPC 2 and 1 (MMC, Jere, and Mafa)
- 3,532 per capita for HHs in Konduga town
- 35,320 Maximum transfer value
- 3,532 Minimum transfer value
- Household size has moved from 4.4-5.4

Justification for the per Capita Approach

- Cost efficiency
- Ensuring equity
- Harmonisation of transfer value
- Harmonisation of transfer approach

Advantages of the per capita approach:

- At the onset the per capita approach has ensured equity
- There was some marginal efficiency gains

Disadvantages:

- Lack of an inter-operable biometrics data register
- Falsification of households size
- Difficulty in correcting household roosters (Births, deaths, new arrivals)
Mitigation

- Introduction of Biometrics to capture all HHs members
- Having an inter-operable biometric data
- Better sensitization of the community leaders and members

DISCUSSIONS:

- Protection issues encountered while using per capita approach vs. per HH approach.
- Biometric registration – head of HH vs. every HH members
- Min. and Max. HH size.

5 Sector updates

Damboa

- Following the ongoing military operations around Damboa LGA, the Nigerian military started to relocate displaced families from the Sabon Gari community to Damboa town on 26 May. The military provided transport for the civilians while others brought their own vehicles or bicycle. Some families were reported to come on foot. The approximate distance from Sabon Gari to Damboa is 52 km.

- As of 07 June, 2,236 families or 10,358 individuals have been registered by ETT. 80 per cent of the displaced families are sleeping outside at GSS camp (Government Secondary School). The rest of the families are still staying in Unity Camp 2 and inside the roofed buildings in GSS.

- Due to the proximity of the transit site where the IDPs are currently located, the military plans to temporarily relocate the IDPs to the abandoned school buildings close to Damboa low-cost housing estate.

- Following the DHC, OCHA and IOM visit, the military confirmed that the IDPs from Sabon Gari will stay in Damboa longer than planned. This new development will affect the planned construction of communal shelters and switch to construction of emergency shelters instead. A 12.5 hectare land has already been approved for construction of shelters and additional space is being requested to accommodate all the shelters that are needed to host around 2,000 families who are currently living outside.

- WFP, through IMC, have commenced dry food distribution to new arrivals since 01 June (WFP/IMC was providing wet-feeding before June). A total of 10,200 new arrivals have been provided with food rations as of 07 June. Additionally, the LGA through the Camp Chairman gave the new arrivals some rice, cooking oil, one cow and condiments.

- Lack of shelters creates challenge for food storage at household level and increases the risk of food spoilage, especially as the rainy season has begun. To address this challenge, IMC is distributing 15-day dry food ration continuously to reduce the household’s needs for food storage.

- Monthly food assistance to existing caseloads in Damboa is also ongoing.

Rann

- One month general food distribution in Rann started 27th May, and continued through to 2 June with no incident, good community engagement and acceptance;
- As of 2 June some 27,050 of expected total of 28,540 beneficiaries had been covered, representing 94% of the total expected coverage.
The total registered beneficiaries for Rann are about 29,994, however, 28,540 are estimated to be in Rann at this time.

It was reported that Borno state Governor gave CJTF 3 vehicles and 23 trucks of food items, including millet, rice, semovita, veg oil and sugar. They were grouped into 6 individuals per group to receive 2 bags of rice (50kg), 6 sachets of spaghetti, 1 bag of semovita (15kg), 6 sachets of sugar for 6 people. The distribution was staggered for two days—day one for women while second day for men. The distribution was coordinated by the military.

**Fertilizer**
- 27 May: Recently, the FSS raised the issue in the meeting between humanitarians and Theatre Commander on 27 May; however, the feedback we got is that the restriction remained unchanged.
- 14 June: After being briefed by the sector, OCHA DHoO has also highlighted the challenge and the urgency of it during the Army Command CIMIC team’s visit in Maiduguri on 14 June.
- Our monthly sector IM products and OCHA sitrep to advocate on this issue
- FAO is engaging with ONSA and authorities at Abuja level to visit Maiduguri and unblock the issue.

**Deterioration in food security**
- The WFP EFSA findings indicate an increase in the prevalence of food insecure households in some LGAs across Borno, Yobe and Adamawa States (ex: Damboa, Magumeri, Mobbar, Maiduguri, Monguno, Nganzai, Askira/Uba, Biu, Kaga and Gubio, etc.). This trend is attributed to an overall worsening of the security situation, new waves of displacement and reduction of agricultural area during the last planting season around the garrison towns in Northern, Eastern and Central areas of Borno.
- Soon based on the CH results, from June onwards, the gap analysis will be updated to inform/readjust the FSL response coverage/caseload. Partners are looking into resources in preparation for potential scale-up in the coming weeks/months.

**Information Management**
- Five standard monthly IM products (see below)
- New features in the FSS Cash Dashboard: Analysis on conditionality and restriction; Top 10 LGAs with FSL related CVA.
- In addition to FSS own cash dashboard, as part of the inter-sector efforts, FSS also contributes to the inter-sector OCHA cash dashboard.

**FOOD SECURITY SECTOR DASHBOARD - APRIL 2019**
During the reporting period of April 2019, a total of 1,401,047 unique people were supported with food security interventions in Borno, Yobe, and Adamawa states; 1.2 million of which were supported with emergency food assistance and around 220,000 were with agriculture and livelihood assistance. Among them, around 72,710 individuals received both forms of assistance. The Sector continues to advocate for the urgent need for farmers and pastoralists to have safe and secure access to land for livelihoods, especially as partners are scaling up the rainy season agriculture campaigns. To enhance agriculture productivity, it is particularly critical to ensure that fertilizer movement is facilitated and farmers are able to access fertilizers to support productions.

**FOOD SECURITY SECTOR CASH DASHBOARD - APRIL 2019**
In April 2019, the Food Security Sector assisted 1,401,047 unique individuals, of whom nearly 49% (680,325) received assistance through cash transfer programming (CTP). Twenty-four organizations,
including national and international NGOs and UN agencies, applied various transfer delivery mechanisms, such as cash in hand, mobile money transfers, paper vouchers and electronic vouchers. Of those assisted with CTP, 79% (539,452) were under SO1 (Food Assistance) while 21% (140,873) under SO2 (Agriculture and Livelihoods). Borno state hosts the highest caseload, approximately 84% of the CTP beneficiaries, compared to 12% and 4% in Yobe and Adamawa states, respectively.

**FOOD SECURITY SECTOR PARTNER PRESENCE MAPS - APRIL 2019**

Partners in Borno State assisted a total number of 1.2 million people during April 2019, with around 123 thousand in Yobe State and 58 thousand in Adamawa State. The Partner Presence Map supports partners to quickly identify organizations working in a particular area to improve coordination among actors and be alert on any possible critical absence of partners. By reviewing partner presence, partners with ongoing/planned interventions in an area are informed of which partners to engage with to create synergies, prevent duplication of efforts and exchange operational information.

**FOOD SECURITY SECTOR SO1 GAP ANALYSIS - APRIL 2019**

During April 2019, the sector partners assisted more than 1.2 million individuals with food assistance (through in-kind distribution or cash/vouchers) in the three most affected north-east states of Nigeria. The largest gap identified remains in Adamawa State, followed by Yobe State and Borno State. Regarding food assistance in Rann, partners are looking into in-kind modality to conduct distributions in May before roads close due to the rainy season. Joint advocacy efforts continue to call for the Government to ensure people who return are provided with satisfactory conditions of safety, dignity and security, as outlined in the endorsed Borno Returns Strategy and international laws.

**FOOD SECURITY SECTOR SO2 GAP ANALYSIS - APRIL 2019**

During April 2019, the sector partners have assisted around 220,000 individuals with agriculture and livelihood interventions in the three most affected north-east states of Nigeria. In order to have better joint understanding/coordination among sector partners who planned to carry out seed distribution in 2019 rainy season, sector partners are coordinating with each other through the Agriculture and Livelihood Working Group forum to prevent duplicative efforts and encourage complementarity in upcoming seed distribution campaigns. It is anticipated that the number of people receiving agriculture and livelihoods support will significantly increase in the coming months as partners scale up rainy season distribution to support food production.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Partner updates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Propcom:</strong> According to Propcom, they are in the process of arranging a meeting between ONSA and private sector (fertilizer industry in NE) as this restriction affects not only NGOs/UN agencies but also private sector (fertilizer producers).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AOB:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Cadre Harmonize analysis update for the NE three states is ongoing in Maiduguri this week. Partners are encouraged to participate and provide inputs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLOSING:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>With no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:05 pm. The next meeting is scheduled on 02 July (Tuesday), 10am, MoANR.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**IN ATTENDANCE:** 31 partners were in attendance - 42 individuals (7 Females & 35 Males)
<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>MOA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>CRS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>IBCCIN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>FAO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>DRC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>SIF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>SEMA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>ADRA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>GREENCEDE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>WFP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>CARE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>HARAF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>ICRC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>SCI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>DHCBI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>NCFRMI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>IRC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>SAF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>ZOA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>SACSUL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>TEARFUND</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>LPF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>IMC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>SHI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>INTERSOS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>JDPH</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>NRC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>PI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>CAID</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>PROPCOM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>