

MINUTES OF THE BORNO FOOD SECURITY SECTOR MEETING

Location: Borno State Ministry of Agriculture and Natural Resources (MoANR), Conference Room

Date: 07 May 2019

Time: 02:05 pm – 03:42 pm

AGENDA

1. Welcome, Opening Remarks and Round of introductions (5 min)
2. Review of action points and approval of minutes of the previous meeting (5 min)
3. Discussion on FSL-related complaint and feedback referral pathway and tools, led by WFP (15 min)
4. Presentation on its proposed *per capita* approach in cash transfer programs and consultation with other partners, by WFP (20 min)
5. Sector updates (20 min)
 - a. Operational updates
 - b. Contingency planning for rainy season and military operations
6. Partner updates (15 min)
 - a. Government stakeholders (MoA, PCNI, NEMA, SEMA, MRRR, NCFRMI, etc.)
 - b. Others
7. AOB (5 min)

SUMMARY OF ACTION POINTS

1. Sector to invite the National Social Safety Nets Coordinating Office (NASSCO) to the sector meeting
2. Sector with support from partners to revise the harmonization and targeting guidance notes
3. Sector through its SAFE WG to follow up with CCCM/S-NFI Sector on fire incident analysis and possible joint actions on fire prevention and awareness raising
4. Sector to share findings of the inter-sector rapid assessment on informal sites in MMC
5. Sector to follow up with WFP on FSL-related CFM and invite WFP to present and lead a discussion

No	PROCEEDING	ACTION POINTS
1	<p>Welcome, Opening Remarks and Round of introductions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The chair sent apologies as he was on a field trip in Bama in supporting of the government-led seed distribution planning. • This was followed by self-introductions from the participants present in the meeting. 	
2	<p>Review of action points and approval of previous minutes</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sector to invite the National Social Safety Nets Coordinating Office (NASSCO) to the sector meeting – Pending 2. Sector with support from partners to revise the harmonization and targeting guidance notes- Pending 3. Sector to follow up on the food assistance for the new arrivals from Gajigana in El-Miskin site - Sector reached out to potential additional partners, including PCNI, however, they were not able to provide one-off gap filling support in April. Existing partner, ACF, will incorporate the new arrivals from May onwards under their new grants. 4. Sector through its SAFE WG to discuss with CCCM/S-NFI Sectors on possible joint actions on fire prevention and awareness raising – This discussion is ongoing and the feedback will be shared. <p><u>Comment:</u></p>	<p>Pending items from the meeting will be part of the action points for next meeting</p>

	<p>A partner asked when the harmonization and targeting guidance notes will be finished. The Sector mentioned that there is no specific timeline for this as currently more focus is on the upcoming rain season planning. Thereafter, this will be followed up as well.</p> <p>After the review, the minutes of the meeting held on 07 May was adopted.</p>	
3	<p>Discussion on FSL-related complaint and feedback referral pathway and tools, led by WFP</p> <p>WFP colleague was not able to present due to field mission. The presentation and discussion have been postponed. Partners were asked to share experiences and/or templates being used to refer protection cases with food needs to FSL partners. No partner provided specific examples but recommended that WFP could consult with SCI and the AAP WG (within ISWG) as they have more experience.</p>	Sector to follow up with WFP on FSL-related CFM and invite WFP to present and lead a discussion
4	<p>Presentation on its proposed <i>per capita</i> approach in cash transfer programs and consultation with other partners, by WFP</p> <p>WFP intends to implement the pilot project of per capita based Cash Based Transfers in Ngala. WFP is already providing food assistance through per capita based support. Moving towards per capita for Food Assistance through Cash Based Transfers</p> <p><u>Background</u></p> <p>In June 2017, the Harmonization guide of the Food Security Sector (FSS) recommended per capita transfer with a maximum of 10 members for households with more than 10 members. For the partners that do not use per capita distribution, it was recommended to use an average size of 5 members per household in urban areas.</p> <p>In all the discussions about per capita transfer, what has remained unresolved is the lack of clarity on how Per Capita should be designed (ex. Defining the benchmark for the minimum transfer for small households with 1 – 3 members).</p> <p>In Northeast Nigeria, organizations implementing Cash-Based Transfers (CBT) are using different approaches</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WFP applies hybrid: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Per Capita for GFD via Food • Average 5 for GFD via CBT • International Rescue Committee (IRC) – Per Capita • Catholic Relief Service (CRS) - Per Capita • Action Against Hunger (ACF) – Average 7 <p>WFP conducted</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Emergency Food Security Analysis (EFSA) in March 2017; and • Food Security Monitoring Outcome Monitoring (FSOM) in August 2017 <p>The results show that</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Monthly food expenditure increases with household size, whereas the opposite situation is observed for food expenditure per capita. 2. Monthly food expenditure for households with 10 members and above is almost double compared to households with one person - 36,215 NGN and 18,383 NGN respectively. 	

	<p>Food expenditure per capita tends to be six times higher for households with one person (18,383 NGN) compared to households with 10 persons and above (3,612 NGN). Therefore, it is evident that small households have higher expenses per capita in order to maintain a similar standard of living.</p> <p>In the case of Ngala, Per Capita (placing min = 3 and max = 10) is more cost efficient than Average 5 by USD 160,407/month.</p> <p>Justification for Per Capita</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Harmonization Guide of FSS recommends Per Capita 2. Per Capita corresponds to food expenditure of households better than Average 5 3. WFP should standardize the approach for GFD between Food and CBT 4. Per Capita is more cost-efficient than Average 5 5. Per Capita will stop beneficiaries from sub-dividing themselves into multiple units (ex. Biometric registration in Monguno reduced the number of beneficiaries while increasing the number of households.) <p>A Way Forward</p> <p>WFP plans to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Shift from Average 5 to Per Capita in a phased approach 2. Seek advice from FFS members! 3. Define Per Capita approach (ex. Placing min = 3 and max = 10) 4. Conduct the first pilot in Ngala in May 2019, where WFP plans to shift from food to CBT (E-Voucher) in May 2019 5. Measure the relative impacts on household food security outcomes <p>Discussions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One of the reasons of per capita costs for larger households being lower than smaller size households is because larger households buy food in larger quantities which provide discounts for instance from wholesalers, yet very small households normally have to buy items in smaller quantities from retail shops which turn out to be more expensive. The cost of transporting and preparing the food might be cheaper for large households as compared to smaller households. The main reason is that larger households per capita benefit from better economies of scale. • The sector provides a platform for sharing experiences and explaining the pros and cons of various approach but partners together with communities need to select what applies best to their specific contexts. • WFP does bi-weekly food price monitoring which supports in informing the per capita approach for CBT. • IOM biometric verification is used to verify beneficiaries before they are entered into the WFP SCOPE system. 	
5	<p>Sector updates</p> <p><u>SAFE Working Group</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Post-Distribution Monitoring report of 2018 FAO stove distribution published. Partners are encouraged to conduct and share PDMs when they become available. 	

- Energy-related activities are captured in the 5W of the FSS. This will be represented monthly through the FSS dashboard.
- SAFE Workshop and Humanitarian Energy Conference, hosted by the Clean Cooking Alliance and UNITAR, will take place between 29 July – 1 August in Addis Ababa (Ethiopia). For more information, see this link: <https://mailchi.mp/aa8c057a4682/save-the-date-safe-conference-2019?e=699e1814e3>
- Discussion with CCCM sector regarding fire risk prevention, which was also discussed in the FSS. This is an ongoing discussion. Key points of feedback will be shared.

Livestock and Fisheries Working Group

- The Sector with support from partners to set up smaller working groups to develop guidance on:
 - a. Livestock procurement and quarantine
 - b. Common Diseases, signs and symptoms
 - c. Livestock feeds production
 - d. Harmonization of inputs for activities (including the minimum inputs required for each of the activities for sustainability).
- Partners to share their training plans for the second and third quarters for sector compilation to encourage exchange/coordination.
- FAO also made a presentation linking the Group Savings Associations with other livestock activities providing opportunities for savings and credit opportunities.

Agriculture and Livelihoods Working Group

Partners also discussed regarding the intention of seed distribution. In summary, partners agreed that the produce expected from the production from farmers may not be sufficient for commercial purposes but mainly for household consumption. This is mainly because there is limited access to land among the other reasons.

In terms of fertilizer, it was emphasized that urea is not accepted right from the beginning. NPK (15-15-15) and other fertilizers require security clearance to go through and distribute. For this current season, it seems to be difficult with the restrictions. However, agencies are working on the procedures with the government authorities and also elevate advocacy.

Rann

- Some pre-requisites providing food assistance to be provided in Rann include presence of civilian authorities and construction of defensive trench
- The assistance will be In-kind modality since Cash Based Transfer not feasible in short term.
- Remote management will be used as the main means of reaching out to the people in need in Rann
- The main assumption here for the rain season is that only one shot in May can be delivered for food assistance before roads close.
- There is no plan for new registrations in Rann. This was decided in order to reduce the pull factor to Rann given the current security context.
- MSUs assessment will be done and repairs made without new investment:
- Partners are rolling out security analysis for missions, dispatch and distributions

Contingency planning for the response to military operation and rainy season

As per the latest draft figures from OCHA regarding likely impact of the rain season and military operation.

- This draft includes possible arriving LGAs/sites
- The total of people who could be affected by military operations has gone up from **75,300 in the first draft to 78,838 people in this latest draft**
- The total of people who could be affected by floods has also gone up from **255,300 in the first draft to 323,457** people in this latest draft. However, those considered to be **“probable or highly probable”** by floods in the three BAY states is **174,524 people**.
- There is also a likely return of at least 1,937 refugees from Cameroon to Nigeria. **-> From FSS side, this should be higher considering the possible return from Niger and Cameroon. To be updated by OCHA/UNHCR**

Pending points on the Contingency Planning:

- The estimation of military operation related figures and trend is the one that requires more consensus and discussion compared to flood prone figures.
- The arrival LGAs are important, not just the LGAs where the displacement may be coming from.
- There is need to take into consideration the military operation that will affect Yobe.
- The estimated returnee number (not just those that are registered). However, it seems that these parameters are still not very well reflected as we hoped for.
- Currently we do not have any food assistance partners in Biu. However, it is one of the key areas into which displacements will happen.

Planning figures for Preparedness Plan (May – September 2019)

State	People could be affected by floods and storms.	People could be affected by military operations	Registered Refugees in Cameroon to Return to Nigeria	Overall Planning Figures <i>[(Highest number between "people could be affected by floods" and "People could be affected by military operations")+Returnees]</i>
Borno	247,752	78,838		307,665
Yobe	46,343			46,343
Adamawa	29,362		1,937	31,299
Total	323,457	78,838	1,937	385,307

Rainy Season Planning Figures – Borno State

247,753 people estimated to be affected

- BY FLOODS
31,604 total people in the state includes:
 - 17,485 people in highly probable flood LGAs
 - 14,119 people in probable flood LGAs
- STORMS

216,149 total people in the state

- Military Operations in Borno State – Planning Figures

State	LGA	People might be affected by military operations
Borno	Abadam	3,644
Borno	Askira/Uba	17,411
Borno	Biu	894
Borno	Chibok	5,891
Borno	Dambo	19,238
Borno	Guzamala	5,783
Borno	Gwoza	3,556
Borno	Kukawa	4,598
Borno	Marte	4,335
Borno	Mobbar	1,618
Borno	Monguno	10,014
Borno	Ngala	1,855
	TOTAL	78,838

Possible arriving LGAs/Sites for pre-positioning – Based on ETT 2017 & 2018

Below are the priority LGAs since they are expected to be receiving the people who are displaced.

LGA	Planning figures (Highest number people who could be affected by floods and Military Operations)	Food Assistance Partner Present (as of March 5Ws)
Bama	27,525	MC, WFP, DRC*, INTERSOS*
Biu	894	NS
Dikwa	6,930	WFP, CARE*, CAID*
Gwoza	9,864	KABHUDA, NRC, WFP, CARE*, SWNI*
Monguno	58,956	ACF, WFP, Caid*, ACTED*, NRC
Ngala	16,433	WFP, DRC*, INTERSOS*
Maiduguri **	28,707	ACF, PUI, WFP, IMC*, SCI, EYN, NEMA, ICRC
Rann**	-	WFP, CARE*

Rainy Season Planning Figures – Yobe State

46,343 people estimated to be affected

1. BY FLOODS

42,286 total people in the state includes:

- **30,467** people in highly probable flood LGAs
- **11,819** people in probable flood LGAs

2. STORMS

- **4,057** total people in the state

Rainy Season Planning Figures – Adamawa State

29,362 people estimated to be affected

1. BY FLOODS

24,905 total people in the state includes:

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 6,545 people in highly probable flood LGAs - 18,360 people in probable flood LGAs <p><u>2. STORMS</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 4,457 total people in the state <p>Registered Returnees from Cameroon – Planning Figures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Expected Returnees: 4,000 people - Total registered: 1,900 people <p>Source: UNHCR, As 24 April 2019</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="219 554 727 840"> <thead> <tr> <th>Destination</th> <th>Households</th> <th>Individuals</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Gombi</td> <td>24</td> <td>113</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hong</td> <td>10</td> <td>48</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Madagali</td> <td>4</td> <td>9</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Maiha</td> <td>357</td> <td>1,397</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Michika</td> <td>1</td> <td>5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mubi North</td> <td>37</td> <td>130</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mubi South</td> <td>64</td> <td>235</td> </tr> <tr> <td>TOTAL</td> <td>497</td> <td>1,937</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>A partner further mentioned about the many refugees living in Cameroon for a long time suffering without support. Majority have not been registered. The sector mentioned to that there is information that those people have been in Cameroon for more than two years. Government and other key stakeholders have this information. We will wait for any key feedback to share with partners. On this note, the sector also re-emphasized the points of no new registration or not encouraging return to Rann for now – Do No Harm</p>	Destination	Households	Individuals	Gombi	24	113	Hong	10	48	Madagali	4	9	Maiha	357	1,397	Michika	1	5	Mubi North	37	130	Mubi South	64	235	TOTAL	497	1,937	
Destination	Households	Individuals																											
Gombi	24	113																											
Hong	10	48																											
Madagali	4	9																											
Maiha	357	1,397																											
Michika	1	5																											
Mubi North	37	130																											
Mubi South	64	235																											
TOTAL	497	1,937																											
6	<p>Partner Updates</p> <p>Propcom</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilitate some flour mills to support farmers in Adamawa for 10,000 trucks of grain - Facilitating a ToT training for Agro Forestry in Damaturu with ACF supported farmers in Damaturu - Planning to support rice farmers out growers scheme to increase yield with support from Africa Rice <p>FEWSNET</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Opened an office with staff in Maiduguri to support food security monitoring. Focal Point is Mohammed Haji. Contact info will be shared. 																												
7	<p>AOB</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The sector coordination team wishes all those observe Ramadan a peaceful holy month. Partners should plan all their activities in line with this. - During Ramadan time, it is foreseen that there will be increasing number of ad-hoc/one-off food donation. If partners and/or their local partner/CSO are planning to do so, please get in touch with the sector, and we can better channel the resources to where it is most needed. - 5Ws compilation is ongoing. So far at least 11 partners submitted data for April. The sector team appreciated that majority of partners submit on time and apologize for the 	Sector to provide feedback from the results of inter-sector rapid assessment																											

	<p>delay for the March product release due to some data clean up issues. The products will be released this week.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It was reported that several informal sites (ex: Chezcon, Shwari 5, Doro, Doro Baga, Umara Bolori) are in need of food assistance among other services. An inter-sector rapid assessment has been organized for hot spot informal settlements in MMC next week. 	
8	CLOSING: With no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 03:42 pm. The next meeting is scheduled on 21 May (Tuesday), 10am, MoANR	

IN ATTENDANCE: 18 partners were in attendance - 26 individuals (6 Females & 20 Males)

Government/UN/Donors/Others	INGOs	NNGOs
1. UNDP	2. IMC	3. FREE
4. WFP	5. FEWSNET	6. Smiling Hearts Initiatives
7. OCHA	8. CRS	9. JDPH
10. IOM	11. SI	12. KABHUDA
13. CWG	14. ACTED	15. LPF
	16. NRC	17. Salient H.O
	18. Propcom	